



ADMINISTRATION FOR
CHILDREN & FAMILIES
Office on Trafficking in Persons

National Advisory Committee on the Sex Trafficking of Children and Youth in the United States Summary of Meeting December 9–10, 2021

Day 1: Thursday, December 9, 2021 | 2–6 p.m. (Eastern)

The National Advisory Committee on the Sex Trafficking of Children and Youth in the United States (the Committee) convened virtually for its tenth meeting on December 9, 2021. The Office on Trafficking in Persons (OTIP) National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center (NHTTAC) provided technical support to the Committee members and public participants through Zoom. The Committee Chair, Glen (J.R.) Ujifusa, Senior Deputy District Attorney of Multnomah County, Oregon, opened the meeting, held a roll call, and established a quorum.

Committee Members

Present

Rebecca Bender, Rebecca Bender Initiative
Justice Bobbe Bridge (Ret.), Center for Children & Youth Justice
Marissa Castellanos, Catholic Charities of Louisville
Kimberly Chang, M.D., M.P.H., Asian Health Services
Captain Pi Downsbrough (Ret.), Massachusetts State Police
Governor Doug Ducey (Substitute: Maria Fuentes), Arizona
Jordan Greenbaum, M.D., International Centre for Missing & Exploited Children
Stacey Katz, Psy.D., WestCoast Children's Clinic
Judge Robert Lung, 18th Judicial District, Arapahoe County and Douglas County Justice Centers, Colorado
Christine Raino, Esq., Shared Hope International
Judge John J. Romero, Jr. (Ret.), Second Judicial District Court, Albuquerque, NM, Children's Court Division
Glen (J.R.) Ujifusa, Jr., Senior Deputy District Attorney of Multnomah County, OR (Committee Chair)
Yasmin Vafa, Rights4Girls
John Vanek, San Jose Police Department (Ret.)

Erin Williamson, L.C.S.W., M.P.A., Love146

Not Present

Joel Filmore, Ph.D.

Camille Naaktgeboren, Ph.D., University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Kathy Sauve, Lutheran Social Service of Minnesota — Brainerd

Staca Shehan, National Center for Missing & Exploited Children

Other Attendees

The list below is based on registration. Other participants may have participated virtually but did not register and are not listed below.

Federal Participants

Kimberly Casey, the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) Administration for Children and Families (ACF) Office on Trafficking in Persons (OTIP)

Katherine Chon, Director, OTIP, Committee Designated Federal Officer

Lauren Devine, OTIP

Vera Soto Kiefer, OTIP

Public Participants

Margaret Blankemeyer, NHTTAC

Josie Feemster, California Department of Social Services

Shuana Fletcher, Mississippi Department of Child Protection Services

Ashley Garrett, NHTTAC

Bethany Gilot, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative Steering Committee Chair

Madeline Hehir, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative

Nissa Knutson, Public Attendee

Sarah Ladd, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative

Blanca Denise Lance, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative

Erin Laskowski, New Hampshire Department of Health and Human Services

Caroline Palmer, Public Attendee

Katie Ryan, CommonSpirit Health

Tammy Sneed, Public Attendee

Opening Remarks

J.R. Ujifusa welcomed everyone to the tenth public meeting.

Committee Business

Mr. Ujifusa reviewed the agenda for the meeting. The first item on the agenda was an update on the status of the Committee's upcoming report and state self-assessment surveys received from states since the last

public meeting that was held on September 8–9, 2021. The update was followed by a public working session during which members discussed general Committee items and next steps to finalize the report.

State Self-Assessment Survey Response Updates

Lauren Devine provided updates since the last Committee public meeting in September 2021. The Committee received 29 completed responses and one partial response from the state of Hawaii. The state of Washington is expected to submit its response on December 17, 2021, and the state of Wisconsin recently reached out to ask for some updated information about the survey. The state of Nevada also indicated that it plans to submit a late response. Committee members will determine how to reflect information about late or partial responses in their upcoming report. Vera Soto Kiefer shared an updated workbook that reflects all data submitted from states and walked the members through the available datasets in the workbook that reflect the survey responses organized by category.

Ms. Devine shared the draft of the upcoming report and reminded the Committee to focus on consistency in language as well as content and to consider the addition of quotes or call-out boxes. Ms. Devine and Ms. Soto Kiefer will ensure the charts are updated based on the information received from states. Ms. Devine shared that the content of the report would be copyedited and designed after the content was finalized. Ms. Devine highlighted the appendix at the end of the report, which will capture information that is not reflected in the body of the report.

Committee Working Session

Committee Extension

Katherine Chon shared that there are no updates on the Committee's extension request. Ms. Chon confirmed that the Committee's request to Congress was submitted but has not received a response. There are ongoing discussions within HHS and Ms. Chon will alert the Committee as soon as a decision is reached.

Ms. Chon reminded the Committee that without an extension, the Committee will sunset on January 18, 2022. Because an extension has not yet been granted, there will be a Committee meeting scheduled prior to its sunset date. OTIP recognizes the Committee's hope that there will be an update on the Committee's extension requests prior to the last scheduled meeting. Ms. Chon explained that if an extension is granted through either a legislative or administrative avenue, there will be further communication on what the next steps are and how the Committee will operate moving forward. Ms. Chon recognized that there are vacancies on the Committee that have not yet been filled, and those positions will be revisited to enable full membership should there be an extension of the Committee's work. Ms. Chon encouraged members to look out for communications for the upcoming January 2022 public meeting and for updates regarding an extension.

Partial Responses from States

Mr. Ujifusa recommended that the Committee address partial and late responses to the State Self-Assessment Survey in the conclusion or summary of the report by explaining that the Committee had to set a deadline (due to statutory requirements) but acknowledges the states' work and hopes to include these submissions at a later time.

Maria Fuentes, who worked on the response from the state of Arizona, expressed that states could continue to work on their responses as long as they are working on combating human trafficking, but she

wants to respect the states that have completed the survey on time. Mr. Ujifusa recognized that members assisted and contributed to states' responses and agreed that there was an understanding that the due date set by the Committee would limit the content of the responses. Mr. Ujifusa stated that he believes this recognition should be reflected in the report with language that this report was created to meet a deadline as laid out by statute. Mr. Ujifusa went on to say that the Committee should acknowledge that all states struggled with the imposed timeline as a result of COVID-19 and other factors, and the report is not a robust reflection of how human trafficking is being addressed in every aspect of every state but rather the beginning of a conversation.

John Vanek reminded the Committee that the original mandate was to establish standards and measure the states' response to those standards. The Committee is in a middle ground where the standards have been established for states to pursue on their own going forward.

Dr. Jordan Greenbaum agreed that the Committee should respect those states that submitted their responses on time and that those responses are more of a baseline and rough estimate of where states are rather than a comprehensive examination. Dr. Greenbaum also acknowledged that the Committee has provided guidance for states on how to measure outcomes in the future.

Ms. Fuentes agreed that it is important that the Committee make it clear that the responses are a baseline and a way to start a conversation. Ms. Fuentes acknowledged that completing the survey required communication and learning from stakeholders within the state as well as other states. Ms. Fuentes said that the very exercise of completing the survey has been impactful and meaningful.

In terms of the responses from states that were categorized as "not applicable" (N/A), Ms. Fuentes stated that some of the recommendations were addressed in other ways or were statutorily prohibited. Mr. Ujifusa agreed that the Committee wants to acknowledge that an N/A response does not mean that states are not addressing issues or are not aware of them but rather that they are either unable to gather the necessary data to make an answer or may be addressing issues in an alternative way. Mr. Ujifusa stated that this report is a great way for states to reflect upon their work, and if this has helped states with gathering data and communicating across states, the Committee has accomplished something meaningful.

Dr. Stacey Katz agreed that with any sort of data or research, the results capture a moment in time, as efforts are constantly evolving. Mr. Vanek stated that states could utilize the data to learn from one another and understand what other states are doing to address different topic areas.

Marissa Castellanos explained that there was an explanation in the overview that defines what N/A means, but it doesn't reflect the comments that were provided by states in their survey responses. Mr. Ujifusa and Ms. Castellanos categorized the comments, which are now reflected in the overview. Ms. Castellanos reviewed the section with the members to ensure that there weren't any pieces missing. In response to Ms. Fuentes' previous comment, Ms. Castellanos agreed that adding context in the appendix to clarify federal vs. state statutes would be helpful, given some of the comments that were included in state responses.

Mr. Ujifusa reiterated that the Committee needs to be clear that this report is not a ranking system, and the purpose of the Committee is to advise on best practices and provide states with an opportunity to demonstrate what they are doing.

Ms. Soto Kiefer clarified that in some instances, Tier II is written to be indicative that more progress will be made to meet the Committee's recommendations, while for other recommendations, Tier II is synonymous with N/A. The Committee agreed to work together for the remainder of the meeting to finalize the report.

Report

Ms. Devine walked the Committee through the report, explaining that sections one through ten are complete drafts, and sections 11 and 12, along with the conclusion, are not yet complete. The Committee discussed the title of the report and determined that the title will be, "Preliminary State Self-Assessment Overview." The members reviewed and updated the introduction and executive summary and determined that they would review each section on the second day of the public meeting after the draft of the report is updated with language directly from the Committee's Best Practices and Recommendations Report.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m. (Eastern).

Day 2: Friday, December 10, 2021 | 2–6 p.m. (Eastern)

The Committee convened for the second day on December 10, 2021. NHTTAC provided technical support to Committee members and public participants through Zoom. J.R. Ujifusa opened the meeting, held a roll call, and established a quorum.

Committee Members

Present

Rebecca Bender, Rebecca Bender Initiative
Justice Bobbe Bridge (Ret.), Center for Children & Youth Justice
Marissa Castellanos, Catholic Charities of Louisville
Kimberly Chang, M.D., M.P.H., Asian Health Services
Captain Pi Downsbrough (Ret.), Massachusetts State Police
Jordan Greenbaum, M.D., International Centre for Missing & Exploited Children
Stacey Katz, Psy.D., WestCoast Children's Clinic
Judge Robert Lung, 18th Judicial District, Arapahoe County and Douglas County Justice Centers, Colorado
Christine Raino, Esq., Shared Hope International
Staca Shehan, National Center for Missing & Exploited Children
Glen (J.R.) Ujifusa, Jr., Senior Deputy District Attorney of Multnomah County, OR (Committee Chair)
Yasmin Vafa, Rights4Girls
John Vanek, San Jose Police Department (Ret.)
Erin Williamson, L.C.S.W., M.P.A., Love146

Not Present

Joel Filmore, Ph.D.
Governor Doug Ducey (Substitute: Maria Fuentes), Arizona

Camille Naaktgeboren, Ph.D., University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Judge John J. Romero, Jr. (Ret.), Second Judicial District Court, Albuquerque, NM, Children's Court Division

Kathy Sauve, Lutheran Social Service of Minnesota — Brainerd

Other Attendees

The list below is based on registration. Other participants may have participated virtually but did not register and are not listed below.

Federal Participants

Katherine Chon, Director, OTIP, Committee Designated Federal Officer

Lauren Devine, OTIP

Vera Soto Kiefer, OTIP

Public Participants

Kent Bauman, Public Attendee

Pierce Beckham, Public Attendee

Margaret Blankemeyer, NHTTAC

Josie Feemster, California Department of Social Services

Ashley Garrett, NHTTAC

Bethany Gilot, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative Steering Committee Chair

Sarah Ladd, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative

Blanca Denise Lance, National Child Welfare Anti-Trafficking Collaborative

Erin Laskowski, New Hampshire Department of Health and Human Services

Michelle McCormick, Kansas Attorney General's Office

Caroline Palmer, Public Attendee

Opening Remarks

Mr. Ujifusa welcomed everyone to the second day of the tenth meeting.

Committee Business

Mr. Ujifusa reviewed the agenda for the second day of the meeting. The first item on the agenda was the public comment period, which was followed by an overview of the communications plan for the rollout of the report. Finally, the Committee entered a working session to complete the report.

Public Comments

Ashley Garrett read the public comments into the public record. The public comments can be viewed [online](#).

Committee Discussion of Public Comments

Mr. Ujifusa thanked the National Child Welfare Collaborative for their public comment and stated that as soon as the Committee determines if it is extended, they can start to think about how to engage and

respond to the letter. Ms. Castellanos thanked the National Child Welfare Collaborative on behalf of the Committee for all its work in assisting states to complete the State Self-Assessment Survey.

Committee Working Session

Communications Rollout

Ms. Chon encouraged the members to consider what type of dissemination strategies and communications rollout plan they would like OTIP to support. Ms. Chon reminded members that when the recommendations were initially released, the report was combined with a series of short videos recorded by Committee members. OTIP also disseminated letters and templated language that was leveraged by Committee members to share the recommendations within their networks.

Ms. Chon opened the floor to discuss what would be most helpful to the Committee beyond internal communication templates. Erin Williamson stated that the needs of the Committee would be dependent on whether the Committee is extended or not because that would be the difference between a future comprehensive report and the preliminary report being made now to meet statutory requirements. Committee members agreed that the normal communications package is sufficient as they wait for confirmation of the extension.

Ms. Chon added that the communications package language would reflect the Committee's sentiments that this report is a preliminary overview, a snapshot of where states are, and an invitation for states to evaluate their work moving forward, rather than a punitive assessment or ranking of state efforts. Mr. Ujifusa, Ms. Castellanos, and Mr. Vanek volunteered to workshop some of the communications language separate from the work required to finalize the upcoming report.

Report

Ms. Devine reviewed the updates made to the report. Since adjourning the night before, OTIP pulled language from the Committee's interim report, Best Practices and Recommendations Report, into the preliminary report to ensure consistent language. The Committee agreed that having the general graph of tiers at the beginning of each section with a more detailed graph broken down by subsection is preferred, along with federal recommendations in each section.

The Committee reviewed the ten survey result sections of the report and updated the language. The members drafted a note from the Committee in the report, recognizing the challenges that states faced and expressing hope that the Committee will have additional time to fulfill its role.

Upcoming Meeting

The Committee determined that the next meeting would take place virtually on January 6, 2022, from 2–6 p.m. (Eastern).

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m. (Eastern).